BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631466 9

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

VOLUME II

1985-1986

with the assistance of

Mary Bull

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY
NOV 17 1988
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

VOLUME II

1985-1986

with the assistance of

Mary Bull

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin02maku_6

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

PART II

CHAPTER V

INTRODUCTION TO PLANNING

Introduction 413

A. The Origins and Theory of Planning 414

J. Jacobs, "The Death and Life of Great American Cities" 414

Notes 418

W.I. Goodman, et., "Principles and Practice of Urban Planning" 419

Notes 426

Greenspan & Vaughan, "How the Zoning Game is Played: A Look at Land Use Procedures" 426

S. Proudfoot, "Private Wants and Public Needs: The Regulation of Land Use in the Metropolitan Toronto Area" 428

CHAPTER VI

THE OFFICIAL PLAN

(i) Introduction 431

Ontario Economic Council, "Subject to Approval" 431

Note 434

(ii) Conformity 435

Re Cadillac Development Corporation and City of Toronto 435

Holmes et al. v. Regional Municipality of Halton 440

Notes and Questions 441

(iii) The Limits of Official Plans 443

Re Official Plan of Richmond Hill Planning Area 443

Re Borough of Scarborough and the Minister of Housing for Ontario 444

Re City of Brampton Planning Area O.P.A. 75 449

(iv) Upper Tier Municipality Official Plans 451

Campeau Corporation v. Township of Gloucester 451

Notes 454

Csele v. The Corporation of the Town of Pelham et al. 454

Notes 455

C. The Provincial Role in Planning 455

White, "Ontario's Land Use Legislation" 455

Note 459

Union Gas Ltd. v. Corporation of Dawn 460

Notes 463

CHAPTER VII

THE PRIVATE CONTROL OF LAND USES

Introduction 464

A. Restrictive Covenants 465

Tulk v. Maxhay 465

Notes 465

Re Sekretov and City of Toronto 469

Notes 472

B. Building Schemes 474

Hyett, "Restrictive Covenants: An Appraisal of Building Schemes" 474

Megarry & Wade, The Law of Real Property 476

MacGregor et al. v. Boyd Builders Ltd. at al. 479

Notes 481

C. Modification of Restrictive Covenants 485

Notes 485

D. Nuisance 486

Walker v. McKinnon Industries 486

Cairns v. Canada Regining & Smeltin Co. 488

Note 490

Bottom v. Ontario Leaf Tobacco Co. Ltd. 491

Fiss, The Supreme Court - Foreward 493

Notes and Questions 494

CHAPTER VIII

ZONING AND LAND USE CONTROL

A. Introduction to Zoning 495

"Houston Looks for a Heart" the Boston Globe 495

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 496

Note 498

B. The Scope of The Zoning Power 498

(i) Exclusionary Zoning and the Scope of the zoning Power 498

Village of Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co. 498

Note 503

R. v. Brown Camps Ltd. 504

Notes and Questions 508

City of Barrie v. Brown Camps Residentian and Day Schools 509

	Notes and Questions	514
	The Bell Case	514
	Notes and Questions	528
	Dworkin, Hard Cases	529
	Smith v. Towship of Tiny	530
	Re Hutterian Brethern Church of Eagle Creek and Rural Municipality of Eagle Creek	531
	Notes and Questions	532
	Fishman (ed) "Current Dilemmas and Legal Issues" in Housing For All Under Law	532
	Notes and Questions	538
(ii)	Discrimination and Zoning	539
	City of Toronto v. Mendelbaum	539
	City of Verdun v. Sun Oil	541
	Scarborough Township v. Bondi	542
	Notes and Questions	545
	Re Twp. of Noth York Restricted By-Law	545
	H. G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	548
	Notes and Questions	552
(iii)	Bad Faith	556
	Re Cadillac Development Corp. and City of Toronto	556
	Re Wall & Redekop Corp. Ltd. and City of Vancouver	558
	City of Halifax v. Hollet et al.	561
	H. G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	565
	Notes and Questions	567

C. The Administration of Zoning By-Laws 568

Polai v. City of Toronto 568

Notes and Questions 570

D. Prohibiting All Uses 571

R. v. Gibson ex parte Cromiller 571

Corporation of the City of Coquitlam v. Karamanolis 572

Note 573

E. Planning and Land Value 574

(i) The Common Law Position 574

Belfast Corporation v. O.D. Cars Ltd. 574

Notes 580

(ii) The Current Canadian Position 580

Regina Auto Court v. City of Regina 580

Re Simpson and City of Vancouver 582

Hauff v. City of Vancouver 587

Note 590

(iii) The Charter 591

N.B. v. Fisherman's Wharf Ltd. 591

Notes 593

F. Negligence 594

Welbridge Hodings Ltd. v. Metropolitan Corporation of Greater Winnipeg 594

Bowen et al. v. City of Edmonton (No.2) 598

Notes 604

Inland Feeders v. Virdi 604

CHAPTER IX

ZONING REFORMS AND DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

Introduction 610

A. Limitations of Zoning 611

Re Mississauga Golf and Country Club 612

Notes and Questions 614

Town of Uxbridge v. Timber Brothers Sand and Gravel Ltd. 615

Note 617

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 618

B. Reform of Zoning 623

Soo Mill & Lumber Co. Ltd. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie 624

Sunbay Developments Ltd. v. City of London 628

Notes and Questions 631

Re Cogan and City of Toronto 632

Papolis v. Corporation of the Borough of Scarborough 633

Letter on Holding By-law and Development Control 635

Note 639

Re Walmar Investments and City of North Bay 640

Re Sorokalit and Mississauga 641

C. Development Control, Planning Act, s.40 646

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (Div. Ct.) 646

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (S.C.C.) 651

Notes and Questions 653

240953 Developments Ltd. et al. v. Corporation of the City of Hamilton 654

Re City of Toronto Site Plan Control By-law 655

Pepino "Site Plan Control Procedure" 658

Notes and Questions 660

D. Demolition Control, Planning Act, s.33. 662

A.W. Banfield Construction Ltd. v. City of Oshawa 662

Note 664

E. Lot Levies 665

Hudec, "Municipal Exactions and the Subdivision Approval Process: A Legal and Economic Analysis" 665

Notes 673

Re Mills and Land Division Committee of York 674

Notes and Questions 677

Re Steel Co. of Canada and City of Nanticoke 677

Notes and Questions 682

Pinetree Development Co. Ltd. v. Minister of Housing for Ontario 683

Re Frey and Regional Municipality of Peel Land Division Committee 688

Re Glenworth Homes 691

Notes 694

CHAPTER X

PRE-EXISTING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

THE RIGHT TO A BUILDING PERMIT

Introduction 696

A. Ontario 697

(i) The Basic Rule 697

(ii) Mandamus/Judicial Review 698

(a) Traditional Approach 698

City of Ottawa v. Boyd Builders 699

(b) New Approach 704

Woodglen and Co. Ltd. v. North York (1983, Div. Ct.) 704

Notes 706

(iii) Appeal 706

Woodglen and Co. Ltd. v. North York (1983, Co.Ct. 707

Note 709

Woodglen and Co. Ltd. v. North York (1984, Div.Ct) 709

McDonald's Restaurants v. Humm 714

Re Revenue Properties and City of Toronto 717

Foodcorp Limited v. Brampton 719

Bucknall, "Compelling and Issuance of Building Permits New Answers, New Problems" 722

Notes 726

(iv) Applicable Law 727

(a) Zoning By-Laws 727

(b) Official Plans 727

(c) Site Plan Control 727

Re. Dominion Stores Ltd. and Etobicoke 727

Re. Revenue Properties and City of Toronto 730

(d) Interim Control By-Laws 731

(e) Other 731

B. Other Jurisdictions 732

(i) Nova Scotia 732

Re Governors of Dalhousie College & University and City of Halifax 732

Notes 733

(ii) British Columbia 733

Monarch Holdings Ltd. v. Oak Bay 733

CHAPTER XI

CONTINUING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

NON-CONFORMING USES

Introduction 738

(i) Defining the Use 739

Central Jewish Institute v. Toronto 739

Question 742

Regina v. Rutherford's Dairy Ltd. 743

Question 744

(ii) Extension or Enlargement of Buildings 745

Adams J. Uzumeri 745

Note 748

Johnson v. Cholette 749

Notes and Questions 751

(iii) Changing Uses 752

R. ex rel. Skimmings v. Cappy 752

Note 754

(iv) Abandonment of Uses 754

Gayford v. Kolodziej et al. 754

O'Sullivan Funeral Home Ltd. v. Corporation of the City of Sault Ste Marie 755

Notes and Questions 756

(v) Amortization of Uses 757

City of Los Angeles v. Gage 757

Notes 760

(iv) Other Jurisdictions 760

Notes and Questions 760

CHAPTER XII

PROCESS REQUIREMENTS AND THE MUNICIPALITY

Introduction 761

A. Access to Information 762

Makuch, Jackson, "Freedom of Information in Local Government in Ontario" 762

Notes and Questions 770

B. Right to a Hearing 771

(i) Municipal Councils, Police Commissions, and Boards of Education 771

(a) Planning Act 771

Spence v. City of York 771

(b) The Statutory Powers Procedures Act 780

(c) Common Law 780

Atkinson et al. v. The Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 780

Question 783

	Campeau v. Calgary	784
	Notes and Questions	788
	Re Zadrevec and Town of Brampton	789
	Re Maple Leaf Mills and Point Edward	794
	Notes and Questions	796
(ii)	Planning Boards	797
(iii)	Minister's Orders	797
	Re Orangeville Highlands and A.G. Ontario	797
	Notes	799
(iv)	Subdivision Agreements	800
	Homex Realty and Dev. Co. Ltd. v. Village of Wyoming	800
	Notes and Questions	802
(v)	Committees of Adjustment and Land Division Committees	802
(iv)	Nature of the Hearing Required	803
	Re McMartin et al. v. City of Vancouver	803
	Re Bourque	808
	Question	809
(vii)	The Ontario Municipal Board	810
	Ladney v. Township of Moore	811
	Notes and Questions	813

CHAPTER XIII

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTION

Introduction		815
A.	The Jurisdiction of the Ontario Municipal Board	816

(i) General 816

Re Township of North York Restricted By-Law 816

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 818

Notes 818

(ii) Rehearing 819

Re Merrens et al. and Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 819

Note 822

B. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Board's View 823

(i) Member's Values 823

Re Vaughan Planning Area Official Plan Amendment 823

Note 826

(ii) Government Policy 827

Re Township of Caledon Official Plan 827

Notes and Questions 830

(iii) Planning Principles 831

Re Township of Loughborough Official Plan Amendment 10 831

Notes and Questions 834

(iv) Financial & Economic Concerns 835

Re East York By-law 7633 835

Notes and Questions 837

Re Etobicoke By-law 14508 837

Notes and Questions 841

Re Etobicoke Store Wars 841

(v) Land Value and Planning 843

Re McGregor and Scarborough 844

Forum: "The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment" in 1974 Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures 848

Notes and Questions 848

(iv) Minority Rights 849

Re Toronto Restricted Area By-law 348-73 849

Notes and Questions 855

Makuch, "Land uses in Toronto" 855

Jowell, "The Limits of the Public Hearing as a Tool of Urban Planning" 858

C. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Court's View 866

Re Cloverdale Shopping Center Ltd. and Township of Etobicoke 866

Notes and Questions 873

Re Hopedale Developments Ltd. and Town of Oakville 874

Question 878

Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespra et al. (Ont. C.A.) 889

Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespra (S.C.C.) 889

Notes and Questions 891